

**Landfill**

**Proposal Acknowledgment \* RFP: OP-01-14/Landfill and Waste Collections**  
**Date: March 21, 2014/2:00 PM**

**EVALUATION SCORING-LANDFILL LEASE**

<b>Committee Member Summary</b>			
<b>Category</b>	<b>Total MAX Points</b>	<b>Texas Disposal Systems</b>	<b>Republic Services</b>
Finance Impact	245	65	235
Operational Experience - Qualifications	245	170	240
Financial Qualifications - Stability	70	20	70
Adherence to Specifications	70	18	68
Additional Beneficial Criteria Submitted	70	8	68
<b>Total Possible Score</b>	<b>700</b>	<b>281</b>	<b>681</b>
<b>Committee Ranking</b>		<b>2</b>	<b>1</b>

**Notes:**

*Attach a Written Justification for each company's ranking and forward to Purchasing  
 Attach this page of this form and the Written Justification to your Agenda  
 Background Memo*

Proposal Acknowledgment \* RFP: OP-01-14/Landfill and Waste Collections

Date: March 21, 2014/2:00 PM

EVALUATION SCORING-LANDFILL LEASE

Shane Kelton (Chair)			
Category	Max Points	Texas Disposal Systems	Republic Services
Finance Impact	35	10	30
Operational Experience - Qualifications	35	35	35
Financial Qualifications - Stability	10	5	10
Adherence to Specifications	10	2	10
Additional Beneficial Criteria Submitted	10	0	10
<b>Total Score</b>	<b>100</b>	<b>52</b>	<b>95</b>
	<b>Rank</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>1</b>

Tina Bunnell			
Category	Max Points	Texas Disposal Systems	Republic Services
Finance Impact	35	20	30
Operational Experience - Qualifications	35	35	35
Financial Qualifications - Stability	10	5	10
Adherence to Specifications	10	5	10
Additional Beneficial Criteria Submitted	10	0	10
<b>Total Score</b>	<b>100</b>	<b>65</b>	<b>95</b>
	<b>Rank</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>1</b>

Ricky Dickson			
Category	Max Points	Texas Disposal Systems	Republic Services
Finance Impact	35	0	35
Operational Experience - Qualifications	35	35	35
Financial Qualifications - Stability	10	10	10
Adherence to Specifications	10	0	10
Additional Beneficial Criteria Submitted	10	0	10
<b>Total Score</b>	<b>100</b>	<b>45</b>	<b>100</b>
	<b>Rank</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>1</b>

Charlotte Farmer			
Category	Max Points	Texas Disposal Systems	Republic Services
Finance Impact	35	0	35
Operational Experience - Qualifications	35	0	35
Financial Qualifications - Stability	10	0	10
Adherence to Specifications	10	0	10
Additional Beneficial Criteria Submitted	10	0	10
<b>Total Score</b>	<b>100</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>100</b>
	<b>Rank</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>1</b>

Proposal Acknowledgment \* RFP: OP-01-14/Landfill and Waste Collections

Date: March 21, 2014/2:00 PM

EVALUATION SCORING-LANDFILL LEASE

Patrick Frerich			
Category	Max Points	Texas Disposal Systems	Republic Services
Finance Impact	35	10	35
Operational Experience - Qualifications	35	35	35
Financial Qualifications - Stability	10	0	10
Adherence to Specifications	10	5	10
Additional Beneficial Criteria Submitted	10	0	10
	Rank	50	100
		2	1

Rodney Fleming			
Category	Max Points	Texas Disposal Systems	Republic Services
Finance Impact	35	25	35
Operational Experience - Qualifications	35	30	30
Financial Qualifications - Stability	10	0	10
Adherence to Specifications	10	6	8
Additional Beneficial Criteria Submitted	10	8	8
	Total Score	100	69
	Rank	2	1

H. R. "Winkie" Wardlaw III			
Category	Max Points	Texas Disposal Systems	Republic Services
Finance Impact	35	0	35
Operational Experience - Qualifications	35	0	35
Financial Qualifications - Stability	10	0	10
Adherence to Specifications	10	0	10
Additional Beneficial Criteria Submitted	10	0	10
	Total Score	100	0
	Rank	2	1





Committee Member Name: Ricky Dickson

Proposal Acknowledgment \* RFP: OP-01-14/Landfill and Waste Collections

Company Name: Texas Disposal Systems

Service: Landfill

Each committee member must provide a written justification for each score less than the max points that could be awarded. The Project Manger is responsible for collecting the evaluations, completing the Ranking Worksheet and providing a written summary, by company. The Acknowledgment, Ranking Sheet Summary and the Written Justification will be attached the Council Agenda Background Memo and must be retained as the informatin could be subject to the Public Information Act

Scoring Categories	Finance Impact	Operational Experience - Qualifications	Financial Qualifications - Stability	Adherence to Specifications	Additional Beneficial Criteria Submitted
Max Points	35	35	10	10	10
Score	0	35	10	0	0

Notes:

NO FINANCIAL IMPACT PROVIDED

DID NOT SUBMIT FINANCIAL PRICING ACCORDING TO SPECS

NO ADDITIONAL BENEFICIAL CRITERIA SUBMITTED

NO INTEREST IN OPERATING EXISTING LANDFILL

Please supply each committee member with 1 worksheet per company





Committee Member Name: H.M. WINKIE WARDLAW TH  
 Proposal Acknowledgment \* RFP: OP-01-14/Landfill and Waste Collections  
 Company Name: Texas Disposal Systems

Service: Landfill

Each committee member must provide a written justification for each score less than the max points that could be awarded. The Project Manger is responsible for collecting the evaluations, completing the Ranking Worksheet and providing a written summary, by company. The Acknowledgment, Ranking Sheet Summary and the Written Justification will be attached the Council Agenda Background Memo and must be retained as the informatin could be subject to the Public Information Act

Scoring Categories	Finance Impact	Operational Experience - Qualifications	Financial Qualifications - Stability	Adherence to Specifications	Additional Beneficial Criteria Submitted
Max Points	35	35	10	10	10
Score	0	0	0	0	0

Notes:

*The City of SA RFP (Appendix C) requests bids to lease the City of San Angelo Landfill and its appurtenant facilities.*

*The TDS proposal contains no bid to lease said Landfill. It merely offers to manage such facilities for the City on a cost plus basis.*

*This "non responsive" proposal is therefore disqualified from consideration.*

Please supply each committee member with 1 worksheet per company





Committee Member Name: Patrick Frerich  
Proposal Acknowledgment \* RFP: OP-01-14/Landfill and Waste Collections  
Company Name: Republic Services  
Service: Landfill

*Each committee member must provide a written justification for each score less than the max points that could be awarded. The Project Manger is responsible for collecting the evaluations, completing the Ranking Worksheet and providing a written summary, by company. The Acknowledgment, Ranking Sheet Summary and the Written Justification will be attached the Council Agenda Background Memo and must be retained as the informatin could be subject to the Public Information Act*

Scoring Categories	Finance Impact	Operational Experience - Qualifications	Financial Qualifications - Stability	Adherence to Specifications	Additional Beneficial Criteria Submitted
Max Points	35	35	10	10	10
Score	35	35	10	10	10

Notes:

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

Please supply each committee member with 1 worksheet per company



Committee Member Name: Patrick Frerich  
 Proposal Acknowledgment \* RFP: OP-01-14/Landfill and Waste Collections  
 Company Name: Texas Disposal Systems  
 Service: Landfill

Each committee member must provide a written justification for each score less than the max points that could be awarded. The Project Manger is responsible for collecting the evaluations, completing the Ranking Worksheet and providing a written summary, by company. The Acknowledgment, Ranking Sheet Summary and the Written Justification will be attached the Council Agenda Background Memo and must be retained as the informatin could be subject to the Public Information Act

Scoring Categories	Finance Impact	Operational Experience - Qualifications	Financial Qualifications - Stability	Adherence to Specifications	Additional Beneficial Criteria Submitted
Max Points	35	35	10	10	10
Score	10	35	0	5	0

Notes:

Financial Impact: Pricing / Pricing structure did not align with City requested parameters

Financial Qualifications: No Financials provided in submission

Adherence to Specifications: Did not provide proposal for lease of landfill, no liability assumption. Several exceptions to specifications presented.

Additional Criteria: None submitted

Please supply each committee member with 1 worksheet per company



Committee Member Name: Shane Kelton

Proposal Acknowledgment \* RFP: OP-01-14/Landfill and Waste Collections

Company Name: Texas Disposal Systems

Service: Landfill

Each committee member must provide a written justification for each score less than the max points that could be awarded. The Project Manger is responsible for collecting the evaluations, completing the Ranking Worksheet and providing a written summary, by company. The Acknowledgment, Ranking Sheet Summary and the Written Justification will be attached the Council Agenda Background Memo and must be retained as the Informatin could be subject to the Public Information Act

Scoring Categories	Finance Impact	Operational Experience - Qualifications	Financial Qualifications - Stability	Adherence to Specifications	Additional Beneficial Criteria Submitted
Max Points	35	35	10	10	10
Score	10	35	5	2	0

Notes:

Cost + 20% is very hard to quantify from the City's side

Financial records as requested were not in the response and a letter from a bank was used to ASA substitute

The response followed the out line but did not cover the scope of services requested in any option but was presented w/ a long list of exceptions or major modification

Please supply each committee member with 1 worksheet per company





Committee Member Name: Tina Bunnell

Proposal Acknowledgment \* RFP: OP-01-14/Landfill and Waste Collections

Company Name: Republic Services

Service: Landfill

Each committee member must provide a written justification for each score less than the max points that could be awarded. The Project Manger is responsible for collecting the evaluations, completing the Ranking Worksheet and providing a written summary, by company. The Acknowledgment, Ranking Sheet Summary and the Written Justification will be attached the Council Agenda Background Memo and must be retained as the informatin could be subject to the Public Information Act

Scoring Categories	Finance Impact	Operational Experience - Qualifications	Financial Qualifications - Stability	Adherence to Specifications	Additional Beneficial Criteria Submitted
Max Points	35	35	10	10	10
Score	30	35	10	10	10

Notes:

Finance Impact - increase in receivables; high inventory turnover & increase in inventory - could be either strong sales or ineffective buying; contingencies

Please supply each committee member with 1 worksheet per company



Committee Member Name: Tina Bunnell  
 Proposal Acknowledgment \* RFP: OP-01-14/Landfill and Waste Collections  
 Company Name: Texas Disposal Systems  
 Service: Landfill

Each committee member must provide a written justification for each score less than the max points that could be awarded. The Project Manger is responsible for collecting the evaluations, completing the Ranking Worksheet and providing a written summary, by company. The Acknowledgment, Ranking Sheet Summary and the Written Justification must be retained as the information could be subject to the Public Information Act

Scoring Categories	Finance Impact	Operational Experience - Qualifications	Financial Qualifications - Stability	Adherence to Specifications	Additional Beneficial Criteria Submitted
Max Points	35	35	10	10	10
Score	20	35	5	5	0

Notes:

Finance impact - no financial statements presented  
 Financial Qualification - Stability - no financial statements presented  
 Adherence to specifications - Tab 13, page 27  
 Additional Beneficial Criteria Submitted - none noted

Please supply each committee member with 1 worksheet per company



Committee Member Name:

*Charles D. ...*

Proposal Acknowledgment \* RFP: OP-01-14/Landfill and Waste Collections

Company Name:

Republic Services

Service:

Landfill

Each committee member must provide a written justification for each score less than the max points that could be awarded. The Project Manger is responsible for collecting the evaluations, completing the Ranking Worksheet and providing a written summary, by company. The Acknowledgment, Ranking Sheet Summary and the Written Justification will be attached the Council Agenda Background Memo and must be retained as the informatin could be subject to the Public Information Act

Scoring Categories	Finance Impact	Operational Experience - Qualifications	Financial Qualifications - Stability	Adherence to Specifications	Additional Beneficial Criteria Submitted
Max Points	35	35	10	10	10
Score	35	35	10	10	10

Notes:

Lined area for notes

Please supply each committee member with 1 worksheet per company



Committee Member Name:

*Charlene Farmer*

Proposal Acknowledgment \* RFP: OP-01-14/Landfill and Waste Collections

Company Name: Texas Disposal Systems

Service: Landfill

Each committee member must provide a written justification for each score less than the max points that could be awarded. The Project Manger is responsible for collecting the evaluations, completing the Ranking Worksheet and providing a written summary, by company. The Acknowledgment, Ranking Sheet Summary and the Written Justification will be attached the Council Agenda Background Memo and must be retained as the informatin could be subject to the Public Information Act

Scoring Categories	Finance Impact	Operational Experience - Qualifications	Financial Qualifications - Stability	Adherence to Specifications	Additional Beneficial Criteria Submitted
Max Points	35	35	10	10	10
Score	0	0	0	0	0

Notes:

*TDS made statement in their letter stating that San Angelo would be best to keep the landfill*

Please supply each committee member with 1 worksheet per company





Committee Member Name: ROANEY FLEMING  
 Proposal Acknowledgment \* RFP: OP-01-14/Landfill and Waste Collections  
 Company Name: Republic Services  
 Service: Landfill

*Each committee member must provide a written justification for each score less than the max points that could be awarded. The Project Manger is responsible for collecting the evaluations, completing the Ranking Worksheet and providing a written summary, by company. The Acknowledgment, Ranking Sheet Summary and the Written Justification will be attached the Council Agenda Background Memo and must be retained as the informatin could be subject to the Public Information Act*

Scoring Categories	Finance Impact	Operational Experience - Qualifications	Financial Qualifications - Stability	Adherence to Specifications	Additional Beneficial Criteria Submitted
Max Points	35	35	10	10	10
Score	35	30	10	8	8

Notes:

VERY IMPRESSED WITH OVER ALL PACKAGE

*Please supply each committee member with 1 worksheet per company*



Committee Member Name: ROANEY FLEMING  
 Proposal Acknowledgment \* RFP: OP-01-14/Landfill and Waste Collections  
 Company Name: Texas Disposal Systems

Service: Landfill

Each committee member must provide a written justification for each score less than the max points that could be awarded. The Project Manger is responsible for collecting the evaluations, completing the Ranking Worksheet and providing a written summary, by company. The Acknowledgment, Ranking Sheet Summary and the Written Justification will be attached the Council Agenda Background Memo and must be retained as the informatin could be subject to the Public Information Act

Scoring Categories	Finance Impact	Operational Experience - Qualifications	Financial Qualifications - Stability	Adherence to Specifications	Additional Beneficial Criteria Submitted
Max Points	35	35	10	10	10
Score	25	30	-0-	6	8

Notes:

MAIN OBJECTION - FAILURE TO FOLLOW RFP INSTRUCTIONS  
NO OWNERSHIP OF LANDFILL - WANTS CITY TO  
TAKE ALL THE RISK.

Please supply each committee member with 1 worksheet per company